

Records of Meetings

Year: 2018

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Panel.

Signed

Listie

.....

Chairman Senator Kristina Moore

Record of Meeting

Date: 19th June 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Inaugural meeting and Vice Chairman	
The Chairman welcomed Members to the first meeting of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel under the new States Assembly and thanked them for agreeing to join the Panel.	
It was agreed to appoint Deputy Steve Ahier as Vice-Chairman of the Panel.	
2. Declarations of Interest	
The Panel noted the provisions of the Scrutiny Proceedings Code in relation to the declaration of interests.	
The following Members declared an interest in relation to areas relevant to the Panel's remit:	
• Senator Kristina Moore declared that her husband was a partner in a local law firm and a member of the Tour de Role	
• Connétable Richard Vibert declared that he was engaged as a consultant with the Sanne Group.	
 Deputy Jess Perchard declared that she had been invited to join the board of governors of a local school. 	
3. Panel Remit	
The Panel received a briefing paper and noted that its remit included the work of the Chief Minister, Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Minister for External Relations.	
4. Working Practices	
The Panel received a briefing paper on working practices. It was agreed to hold regular scheduled Panel meetings on alternate Tuesday mornings at 9.30am.	
It was agreed to schedule public hearings with each of the Chief Minister, Minister for Treasury and Resources and Minister for External Relations prior to the States Assembly summer recess. It was also agreed to schedule further public hearings with each Minister in the Autumn.	

5. Legacy Report	
5. Legacy Report	1
The Panel discussed the Legacy Report of the previous Corporate Services Scrutiny	1
Panel and the areas recommended for further work.	l
6. Work Programme	. <u></u>
	l
A briefing paper on future work programme was considered by the Panel.	1
The Chairman declared an interest in relation to the draft Access to Justice Law, by	l
way of her husband's position in a local law firm and noted that she would recuse herself from any work that the Panel might undertake.	l
It was noted that any other Panel member could lead a review on behalf of the Panel	l
or a sub-panel could be established for specific reviews. It was agreed that the Vice-	l
Chairman would lead initially on any review of the draft Access to Justice Law.	1
It was a supported to us support initial building a frame as ab day automate within the Day allo us with	SS
It was agreed to request initial briefings from each department within the Panel's remit on their forthcoming work programmes.	
on their forthcoming work programmes.	l
Noting that the Migration Policy was scheduled for debate on 11th September, the	l
Panel discussed the possible scope of a detailed review of the policy.	l
7. States Business	
	l
The Panel noted forthcoming States business within its remit.	l
8. Marriage and Civil Status (Jersey) Law	
	1
The Panel noted receipt of a report from the Community and Constitutional Affairs	1
Department on the implementation of the Marriage and Civil Status (Jersey) Law and	1
agreed that no further action was necessary.	1
9. Scrutiny Training	1
	1
The arrangements for scrutiny member training were noted by the Panel.	L

Record of Meeting

Date: 27th June 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Absent	Deputy Steve Ahier
Apologies	
In attendance	Robert MacRae QC, H.M. Attorney General Tom Walker, Chief Officer, Community and Constitutional Affairs Crown Advocate Andrew Belhomme, Law Officers Department David Le Marquand, Policy Office, Community and Constitutional Affairs Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Draft International Co-operation (Protection from Liability) (Jersey) Law	
The Panel received a briefing from HM Attorney General and other officers in relation to P.54/2018 Draft International Cooperation (Protection from Liability) (Jersey) Law.	
The record of the meeting is classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 31.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
T TESETIL	
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Emma Le Ruez, States Greffe Project Officer
	Item 1 only:
	Hannah Maden-Adams, Digital Communications Officer
	Item 13 only:
	Deputy Rob Ward, Chairman, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel
	Deputy David Johnson
	Robert MacRae QC, H.M. Attorney General
	Advocate Adam Clarke, Judicial Greffier
	Advocate Paul Matthews, former Judicial Greffier
	Tom Walker, Chief Officer, Community and Constitutional Affairs
	Dennis Dixon, Law Officers Department
	David Le Marquand, Policy Officer, Community and Constitutional Affairs
	Andrew Harris, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Communications support	
The Chairman welcomed the States Greffe Digital Communications Officer to the meeting. The Digital Communications Officer explained her role and the support that she could provide to the Panel.	
2. Record of Meeting	
The record of the meeting held on 18th June 2018 was approved by the Panel.	
3. Future Meeting dates	
A schedule of meetings for 2018 was noted by the Panel. The schedule was approved, subject to an amendment to reflect that the Panel would not meet on 14th August 2018.	
4. Hearings and briefings	
The Panel noted arrangements for forthcoming public hearings and private briefings.	
It was agreed to proceed with visits to each of the departments within the Panel's remit and the Officer was asked to make the necessary arrangements.	

5. Taxation of non-residents' pensions	
It was noted that public concerns had been raised recently both in the media and directly to States Members regarding the removal of marginal tax relief for non-residents in the 2016 Budget. It was noted that the original aim of this measure appeared to have been focussed on property income generated by non-residents. However, concerns had been raised about the adverse impact on income from private pensions.	
It was agreed to request further information from the Treasury Department on the number of people affected by the removal of marginal relief for non-residents and the amounts involved.	
6. States Employment Board Review of Bullying	
The recent publication of a report on bullying and harassment within the States of Jersey was discussed.	
Noting that the report raised significant areas of concern, it was agreed to write to the Chief Minister to request:	
 The actions to be taken in response to the report The timescale for responding to the report An unredacted copy of the report 	
It was also agreed to request that Deputy Tracey Vallois, in her capacity as Chairman of the States Employment Board, attend the Panel's forthcoming quarterly public hearing with the Chief Minister, in order to answer questions on the matter.	SS
7. States of Jersey Communications Strategy	
A suggestion from a member of the public was considered in relation to a review of the new States communication strategy. It was noted that this topic would be covered in the Panel's forthcoming briefing on the OneGov project and that questions could be put to the Chief Minister at the forthcoming quarterly public hearing.	
8. Information Commissioner	
The Panel discussed the impact of changes to Jersey's and Guernsey's Data Protection laws and the move away from a joint Information Commissioner post. It was agreed to put questions to the Chief Minister on this matter at the forthcoming quarterly public hearing.	
9. Draft International Co-operation (Protection from Liability) (Jersey) Law (P.54/2018)	
The Panel recalled the briefing it had received on <u>P.54/2018</u> on 27th June 2018. It was noted that correspondence had been received from the Law Society in relation to the consultation process undertaken prior to the law being drafted. It was agreed to seek confirmation from departmental officers that the comments raised by the Law Society had been taken into account when the law was drafted.	
It was agreed that the Vice-Chairman would report back to the States Assembly on the Panel's work during the debate of P.54/2018 on 10th July.	
10. Work Programme	
The Panel noted a draft work programme for 2018 incorporating the topics discussed at its last meeting.	

It was noted that in reply to the Panel's letter to the Chief Minister enquiring about the	
status of the Migration Policy, a response had been received indicating that a final decision on whether to maintain the policy had not yet been made by the new Council	
of Ministers. It was agreed not to proceed with a review of the Migration Policy for the	
time being.	
11. States Business	
The items of business for the sitting of the States Assembly on 10th July were	
discussed, with regard to any items falling within the Panel's remit.	
The Developer discussed and encourse of its word, which wight the subtrate for Marshare	
The Panel also discussed any areas of its work which might be suitable for Members	
to submit oral questions on. 12. Items for communication	
12. Items for communication	
The Chairman explained that the Panel's future agendas would include a standing item	
regarding key points from the meeting which the Panel wished to communicate.	
13. Draft Access to Justice Law	
The Panel received a briefing from H.M. Attorney General, the Judicial Greffier, the	
Chief Officer, Community and Constitutional Affairs and other officers in relation to the	
draft Access to Justice Law.	
The second of this part of the second is a close if all as exempt in a constance with the	
The record of this part of the meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the	
Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 31.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 4th July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Deputy Kirsten Morel, Chairman, Brexit Review Panel Senator Sarah Ferguson, Brexit Review Panel member Kate Nutt, Group Director, External Relations David Walwyn, Director, External Relations Nicola Noble, Senior External Relations Officer Anna Siodlak, External Relations Officer Dan Marcos, Head of International Compliance Christian May, Head of Communications for the Office of the Chief Executive Richard Corrigan, Group Director, Financial Services Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. External Relations briefing	
The Panel received a briefing from officers on the structure and work programme of the Ministry for External Relations.	
The briefing covered the Ministry's remit and current priorities; Brexit work; the EU Code of Conduct Group on Business Taxation; and the Global Markets Strategy.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 9th July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman, Public Accounts Committee
attendance	Constable John Le Bailley, Public Accounts Committee member
	Deputy Rowland Huelin, Public Accounts Committee member
	Deputy Carina Alves, Public Accounts Committee member
	Richard Bell, Director General, States Treasury and Exchequer and Treasurer of the States
	Tom Walker, Director General, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population
	Camilla Black, Strategic Finance Review Consultant – Transformation Team
	Robert Kirkby, KPMG
	Mark Ashburn, KPMG
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Finance Law briefing	
The Panel met jointly with the Public Accounts Committee to receive a briefing on changes to the Public Finance Law.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 13th July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Emma Le Ruez, States Greffe Project Officer
	Item 1 only: Richard Bell, Director General, States Treasury and Exchequer and Treasurer of the States Camilla Black, Strategic Finance Review Consultant – Transformation Team Chris Le Breton, Assistant Comptroller of Taxes Simon Hayward, Director of Treasury Operations and Investments Tom Queree, Policy and Legislation Manager Kevin Hemmings, Head of Decision Support

Agenda matter	Action
1. Briefing – Treasury work programme	
The Panel received a briefing from officers on the work programme of the States Treasurer and Exchequer Department.	
2. Taxation of non-residents' pensions	
The Panel discussed this matter and agreed to ask questions at its forthcoming public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources.	
The Panel agreed to request a worked example of the taxation implications from the Treasury Department and discussed possible ways of gathering public opinion and submissions in order to understand the scale of the impact of the policy.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 17th July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Item 12 only:
	Dame Kate Barker
	Professor Francis Breedon
	Mr Richard Davies
	Greg Boyd, Senior Economist
	Aaron Girardi, Economist
	Item 13 only:
	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister
	Senator Tracy Vallois, Deputy Chief Minister and Chairman of the States
	Employment Board
	Paul Bradbury, Director of Corporate Policy

Agenda matter	Action
1. Record of Meeting	
The record of the meeting held on 27th June 2018 was approved by the Panel.	
2. Briefings	
The Panel agreed to receive a briefing on the States of Jersey Data Sharing Policy and a briefing from the Community and Constitutional Affairs Department on legislation being brought forward.	
3. Question Plans	
The Panel discussed the question plans for its forthcoming public hearings.	
4. Taxation of non-residents' pensions	
The Panel discussed this matter and noted that questions were included in the question plan for its forthcoming public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources.	
5. States Employment Board Review of Bullying	
Recalling its request to be provided with an un-redacted version of the report on Bullying within the States of Jersey, the Panel noted a response from the Director of Corporate Policy in relation to confidentiality provisions attached to the report.	

In light of the conditions of confidentiality attached to some of the information within the report, the Panel agreed not to pursue an un-redacted version of the report, however it agreed to ask whether a more complete version of the report could be provided, whilst maintaining confidentiality where required.	SS
6. Chairmen's Committee update	
The Chairman updated the panel on a number of matters discussed at the Chairmen's Committee, including:	
 New guidelines for scrutiny briefings Policy Development Boards States IT projects 	
7. Council of Ministers business	
The Panel noted receipt of recent Council of Ministers' papers and agreed that no further action was necessary.	
8. States Business	
The Panel discussed forthcoming States Business.	
It was noted that P.71/2018, States Members Duties, was listed for debate on 11th September and would fall within the Panel's remit. It was agreed to approach the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee to arrange a meeting with him to discuss the matter further.	SS
9. Jersey Development Company	
The Panel noted an invitation from the Managing Director of the States of Jersey Development Company to visit its projects. It was agreed to accept the invitation and agree a suitable date in the Autumn for a visit.	SS
10. Minister for International Development	
It was noted that a Minister for International Development had been appointed by the Chief Minister and that this portfolio would fall within the Panel's remit.	
It was agreed to work towards holding a public hearing with the Minister in early 2019 and, in the interim, to hold the Chief Minister to account for this ministerial portfolio in public hearings.	
11. Items for communication	
The Panel noted the Chairman's radio interview that morning and scheduled television interview later in the day. It was agreed to focus communications around the public hearing with the Chief Minister to be held later in the day.	
12. Fiscal Policy Panel	
The Panel met with the Fiscal Policy Panel for a lunch meeting.	
13. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister	
The Panel welcomed the Chief Minister, Deputy Chief Minister and Director of Corporate Policy to a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 19th July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Emma Le Ruez, States Greffe Project Officer Item 1 only: Deputy Susie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resouces Richard Bell, Director General, States Treasury and Exchequer and Treasurer of the States Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes Alison Rogers, Director of Financial Planning and Performance Simon Hayward, Director of Treasury Operations and Investments

Agenda matter	Action
1. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, Assistant Minister, Treasurer of the States and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
2. Migration Policy	
The Panel recalled that the Migration Policy had been due to be debated on 11th September 2018 and noted the recent announcement that the policy had been withdrawn. The Panel also noted that a policy development board had been established to look at the policy.	
It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister to ascertain his reasons for withdrawing the policy and to raise the involvement of scrutiny in the process.	SS

Record of Meeting

Date: 25th July 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Connétable Richard Buchanan, Assistant Chief Minister Charlie Parker, Chief Executive and Head of the Public Service Stephen Hardwick, Director of Communications Camilla Black, Strategic Finance Review Consultant – Transformation Team Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Emma Le Ruez, States Greffe Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Hearing with the Assistant Chief Minister and the Chief Executive and Head of the Public Service	
The Panel received the Assistant Minister, Chief Executive of the States and officers for a public hearing to discuss the One Government Programme. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 26th July 2018

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Senator Ian Gorst, Minister for External Relations Kate Nutt, Group Director, External Relations David Walwyn, Director, External Relations Tom Le Feuvre, Director, External Relations Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Emma Le Ruez, States Greffe Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Public Hearing with the Minister for External Relations	
The Panel welcomed the Minister for External Relations and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 31st July 2018

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Item 6 only: Katie Falle, Corporate Data Manager Kaval Kalsi, Programme Director (GDPR) Jacqueline Tobias, Law Officers Department Item 7 only: Tom Walker, Director General, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department Simon Hayward, Director, Treasury and Investment Management Sylvia Roberts, Law Officers' Department Dennis Dixon, Law Officers' Department

Agenda matter	Action
1. Record of Meeting	
The records of the meetings held on 3rd (public and private), 4th and 9th July 2018 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Taxation of non-residents' pensions	
The Panel noted receipt of a recent confidential Council of Ministers' paper on this matter and agreed that no further action was required at this time.	
3. States Employment Board Review of Bullying	
The Panel recalled an answer from the Chair of the States Employment Board in a recent public hearing that an action plan to respond to this report was being developed. It was agreed to continue to monitor progress in implementing the action plan.	
It was noted that the Panel had received a letter from the Chief Executive providing further information following his appearance before the Panel. It was agreed to publish the letter and also to request an un-redacted version of a table within the letter.	SS
4. Public Hearing follow up	
Recalling its recent public hearings with the Chief Minister, Treasury Minister, External Relations Minister and Chief Executive of the States, the Panel discussed any follow up action required. It was agreed in particular to monitor the implementation of policy development boards.	
5. Work Programme	
The Panel considered its future work programme and discussed the scope for a review	

into the productivity of Jersey's economy. The Officer was asked to prepare a briefing paper for the Panel to consider at its next meeting.	SS
6. Briefing on Data Sharing Policy	
The Panel received a briefing from officers on the draft Data Sharing Policy.	
It was noted that a draft law would be brought forward in due course, which would be shared with the Panel at an early stage.	
7. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel received a confidential briefing from the Director General of the Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department and other officers on the draft Damages Law.	
The record of this part of the meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th August 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Damages Law	
Recalling the briefing it received on 31st July 2018 with regards to the draft Damages Law, the Panel discussed the scope of a possible review of the draft law. It was noted that the draft law was due to be lodged in early September 2018.	
Key stakeholders were identified and it was agreed to make contact with some with a view to setting up public hearings to be held once the draft law had been lodged for debate.	SS
It was noted that a scoping document and terms of reference for the review would be prepared for the Panel to consider at its next meeting.	SS

Record of Meeting

Date: 28th August 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Emma Le Ruez, States Greffe Project Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Record of Meeting	
The records of the meetings held on 13th, 17th, 19th, 25th and 26th July 2018 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel discussed the structure of its review of the draft damages law, noting that the draft law was due to be lodged in early September.	
It was agreed to approach stakeholders with a view to holding public hearings on the matter on or around 19th September.	
A Scoping Document and Terms of Reference for the review were considered and approved, subject to a minor change being made to the budget for the review.	SS
3. Panel Membership	
It was noted that the Constable of St Martin had informed the Panel that, for personal reasons, she intended to resign from the Panel at the next States sitting on 11th September.	
The Chairman informed Members that Deputy Scott Wickenden was interested in joining the Panel and she would be proposing him as a Panel member at the States sitting on 11th September.	
4. Ministerial Decision process	
The Panel discussed recent media reports of a possible change to the way Ministerial Decisions were recorded and noted an update on the matter provided to the Panel by the Deputy Greffier of the States.	
It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister outlining areas where the Panel had concerns.	

5. Work Programme	
The Panel discussed forthcoming pieces of work, including changes to the Public Finances Law, Budget 2019 and the Council of Ministers' Strategic Plan.	
The Panel discussed a review focusing on productivity, migration and inclusion and noted that the Officer was preparing an initial briefing paper on productivity to be considered at a forthcoming meeting. It was agreed to make these themes a priority for the Panel over the longer term and bring them into other areas of the Panel's work, where possible.	
It was noted that the Chief Minister had indicated publicly that a Policy Development Board would be set up to look at the area of population and migration but that no progress had yet been made on this. It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister to ask for an update and to request the Terms of Reference for this board.	SS
The Panel asked the Officer to make enquiries about briefings on the Council of Ministers' Strategic Plan and also the eGov programme. 6. Finance Transformation	SS
Noting a recent announcement about the appointment of EY as partner for the Finance Transformation programme, the Panel agreed to write to the Treasury Department to ask for further information about the scope and cost of this piece of work. Consideration was also given to submitting a written question in the States Assembly on the matter.	SS
It was further agreed to request a briefing from Treasury on the work that EY would be doing.	SS
The Panel asked to be provided with copies of relevant reports of the Comptroller and Auditor General and the Public Accounts Committee in this area, together with any Ministerial Responses.	ELR
7. One Government programme	
The Panel discussed the ongoing changes to States departments, and reviewed structure charts of the previous and new structures.	
It was noted that it was approaching the one year anniversary of the appointment of the Chief Executive's transition team. It was agreed to ask questions about the achievements of the transition team in future quarterly public hearings.	
8. States Business	
The Panel reviewed the order paper for the States sitting on 11th September and a list of recent Ministerial Decisions within its remit.	
9. Items for communication	
It was agreed to highlight on social media the Panel's work on the One Government programme.	SS
10. Future Meetings	
The Panel noted arrangements for future meetings.	

It was noted that Emma Le Ruez would shortly be finishing her temporary role as	
States Greffe Project Officer. The Chairman thanked her for her work in supporting the	
Panel.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th September 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The records of the meetings held on 31st July (public and private) and 20th and 28th August 2018 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Panel Membership	
The Panel recalled that at its previous meeting it had noted the intention of Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone to resign as a panel member. It was noted that the Connétable was now able to resume her duties and would not be resigning, which was welcomed by the Panel.	
The Chairman informed the Panel that other States Members had expressed an interest in assisting the Panel's work in particular areas. Under Standing Order 138 (5A), it was therefore agreed to co-opt the following members onto the Panel to assist with the consideration and scrutiny of particular topics:	
 Deputy Scott Wickenden in relation to One Government Deputy David Johnson in relation to Population and Migration 	
3. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel discussed a proposed consultation framework for the draft Damages Law. Following a suggestion from government policy officers, it was agreed to share public submissions to the Panel's review with the Government where appropriate. It was noted that the aim of the framework would be to avoid the need for separate consultations by the Government and the Panel at the same time, while ensuring the integrity and independence of the scrutiny process.	
4. Finance Transformation project	
The Panel recalled that it had agreed a number of questions to be sent to the States Treasurer and Exchequer Department regarding the appointment of EY as partner to the Finance Transformation project. It was noted that answers had now been received to the questions. It was agreed to publish the answers and write to the Minister with the Panel's thanks.	SS

5. One Government	
The One Government programme was discussed and it was agreed to write to the Chief Minister in order to obtain an update on progress.	SS
It was also agreed to write to the States Employment Board to request further information on the key performance indicators set for the Chief Executive of the States.	SS
6. Work Programme	
The Panel received a briefing paper on productivity. Noting the purpose and rationale of the Economic Productivity and Growth Drawdown Provision (EPGDP), the Panel agreed to prepare a written question to the Minister for Treasury and Resources for the Chairman to submit to ascertain the status of the EPGDP.	SS
The future work programme for the Panel was discussed. Consideration was given to starting a review of Population and Migration, and key areas of focus were discussed. It was noted that a scoping document would be drawn up for the Panel to consider at a future meeting.	SS
7. States Business	
The Panel reviewed recent Ministerial Decisions which fell within its remit and discussed a recent Ministerial Decision, "Contingency Allocation: Revised Policy – August 2018". It was agreed to include this in a written question to the Minister for Treasury and Resources. Noting that an Investment Appraisal Board had been established pursuant to the Contingency Allocation policy, the Panel agreed to request copies of all recommendations of the Board going forward.	SS
8. Items for communication	
Recalling that it had agreed to publish answers from the States Treasurer and Exchequer Department on the Finance Transformation project, it was agreed to publicise the answers via social media.	SS
9. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was on Tuesday 2nd October at 9.30am in the Blampied room.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 2nd October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Kevin Hemmings, Head of Decision Support, States Treasury and Exchequer Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Tom Leveridge, Scrutiny Officer (items 7-10 only)

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The record of the meeting held on 12th September 2018 was approved by the Panel.	
2. Draft Damages Law	
Proposed amendments to the Terms of Reference for this review were noted and approved by the Panel.	
A final consultation framework for the review was approved by the Panel.	
3. Draft Budget 2019	
Noting that the Draft Budget 2019 was due to be published the following week, the Panel reviewed a draft scoping document for a review of the budget.	
The Panel discussed suitable expert witnesses to approach to provide evidence on the draft Budget. It was agreed to approach John Shenton to act as an expert witness to the Panel. Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone declared an interest, in that Mr Shenton was her brother.	SS
It was agreed to consider, once the draft Budget had been published, whether there were any identifiable areas where technical advice might be required and to include provision in the review budget accordingly.	
4. Common Strategic Policy	
The Panel noted that the Council of Ministers' Common Strategic Policy was due to be published the following day. It was agreed that any work undertaken by the Panel in relation to the Common Strategic Policy should include particular consideration of population and migration.	

5. Population and Migration	
Recalling that it had previously agreed to co-opt Deputy David Johnson to work with it	
on population and migration, the Panel noted an update that Deputy Johnson was now not able to accept this invitation.	
The Panel considered a summary document of the areas relevant to population and migration that it had previously identified. Further topic areas were identified to include within the Panel's work.	
It was agreed to proceed with a review of population and migration and the Panel requested that a scoping document be prepared. It was agreed that Deputy Perchard would act as lead member.	SS
6. States Business	
The Panel reviewed and noted recent Ministerial Decisions which fell within its remit.	
7. Keeping children in mind	
It was agreed to commit to consider children in all future Panel work, through the scoping document for each review it undertook.	
8. Training	
The Panel welcomed the Head of Decision Support, States Treasury and Exchequer to provide it with a short training session on the structure of States finances.	
9. Items for communication	
The Panel identified the key points from its meeting that it wished to publicise.	
10. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was on Tuesday 16th October at 9.30am in the Blampied room.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Item 1 only:
	Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States
	Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes
	Cora O'Brien, Deputy Director, Revenue

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Budget 2019	
The Panel received a briefing from the Treasurer of the States and other officers on the 2019 Budget.	
It was noted that the Budget was due to be lodged on 9th October 2018.	
The briefing covered the key elements of the budget, including the economic outlook, States income forecasts, allocation of growth and capital expenditure, proposed movements between reserves and specific taxation measures.	
2. Common Strategic Policy	
It was noted that the Panel had attended a briefing for States Members on 3rd October 2018 on the Council of Ministers' Proposed Common Strategic Policy (CSP).	
The Panel discussed the CSP and noted that it contained 5 key priorities which the Council of Ministers proposed to make the focus of its work.	
The Panel considered where amendments to the CSP might be brought and agreed to proceed with scoping an amendment which would add a sixth priority entitled "nurturing a diverse community". It was noted that this priority would capture areas that the Panel felt were missing from the CSP, such as encouraging inter-generational living, diversity in business and giving consideration to vulnerable people and minority groups.	
It was agreed that work would be undertaken to scope a possible amendment to the CSP for the Panel to consider in due course.	SS

Record of Meeting

Date: 10th October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard Deputy Scott Wickenden
Apologies	
In attendance	Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General Andy Harris, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Meeting with the Comptroller and Auditor General	
The Panel received Karen McConnell, Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG), for a briefing in relation to her work on financial management in the States of Jersey and the current financial transformation project.	
The C&AG explained that she had undertaken a wide variety of reports in her 6 years in post, with recurring themes emerging in relation to financial management and financial directions. The headline findings within these areas formed the basis of the recommendations contained within her reports <i>R</i> . 138/2015 C&AG Review of Financial Management and <i>R</i> . 19/2016 C&AG Review of Financial Management (Part 2).	
It was noted that one particular recurring theme in relation to organisational culture was key to the States of Jersey achieving the recommendations surrounding financial management. As part of this change it was vital that the organisation listened to its teams in order to mitigate the risks that were inherent in organisational change.	
The C&AG explained that she had begun to see evidence of the recommendations put forward in her report being implemented, with one particular example being the centralisation of finance directors. It was noted that the previous model of operation (whereby finance directors were situated in the individual departments) created significant administration for the directors (i.e. preparing accounts and reporting), which took them away from forward planning initiatives. It was also noted that the manner in which finances were reported needed to be carried out more efficiently.	
Another area identified within the reports that required improvement was that Officers needed to know what good looked like in order to advise politicians more effectively. It was explained that there had been weakness within the Executive function, internal control mechanisms and risk management within the States. It was explained that risk management had improved since the reports were published, however, it was not fully imbedded. It was explained that financial planning, financial monitoring and forecasting and financial performance and reporting required significant improvement within the States of Jersey in order to be more effective and efficient.	

The C&AG outlined the processes that had been recommended in order to secure change. It was noted that the organisational culture would need to change significantly, with more emphasis placed on encouraging change champions that knew what good practice looked like. It was noted that a significant number of people had been brought into the States of Jersey at a high managerial level in order to demonstrate what good practice looked like and change the culture. Once the culture had been imbedded then the structure, systems and processes could also be changed. Further attention should also be paid to the skilling and training of staff and effective performance management systems. It was noted that staff needed to be given confidence in relation to risk management, which in turn would create a more open and honest approach to financial management.

The C&AG outlined the work she had undertaken on Financial Directions within the States of Jersey. It was noted that whilst the need for investment and improvement in this area had been recognised and change had been implemented, progress was slow and, as with financial management, better emphasis needed to be placed on what good practice looked like.

The C&AG explained that the culture around challenging a major project was important, as the more complex they became the tendency to make commitments and be optimistic increased. It was noted that in order to challenge these effectively, emphasis should be placed on the ranges and timescales of the project with better articulation of the changes backed up with evidence to show outcomes. The C&AG noted a response from the Minister for Treasury and Resources to the Panel in relation to questions it had asked about the Financial Transformation project. It was noted that the Finance Transformation project was part of a wider cultural change within the States of Jersey and should be challenged effectively, whilst remaining positive and encouraging openness in relation to the risks it faced.

The C&AG explained that she was happy to speak with the Panel if ever it required any further input on her work or the issues she was addressing.

The Panel requested that a copy of the response from the Minister for Treasury and Resources to its questions on the Financial Transformation Project be circulated along with the executive responses to the two reports by the C&AG.

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Stephanie Addison, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Budget 2019	
The Panel recalled that it had received a briefing on the draft Budget Statement 2019 on 5th October and that the draft Budget Statement had been lodged on 9th October as <u>P.114/2018</u> .	
The Panel reviewed the draft Budget Statement and noted that key stakeholders would be contacted to provide comment on the proposals. It was agreed to also seek specific evidence on:	
Removal of marginal relief for non-residents	
 Stamp Duty The proposed transfer of £50 million to the stabilisation fund in 2019 	
2. Revenue Administration Law	
It was noted that the Revenue Administration Law was due to be lodged shortly, for debate alongside the Draft Budget Statement 2019 on 4th December 2018.	
In light of other items of business due to be debated on 4th December which required review by the Panel, it was agreed to ask the Minister for Treasury and Resources to delay the debate of the Revenue Administration Law until 29th January 2019.	
3. Transfers from the Capital Programme (R.132/2018)	
The Panel noted the publication of <u>R.132/2018</u> , "Transfers Between Heads of Expenditure under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2005: Article $18(1)(c)$ and $(1A) - 5$ th October 2018".	
Concern was noted about the return of unspent funds in relation to Sandybrook care home, homes for children with autism and projects at the prison. It was agreed to seek further information about these projects and the rationale for the funding being returned.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 16th October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
	Item 8 only: Senator Sarah Ferguson (Chairman, Public Accounts Committee) Connétable John Le Bailly (Public Accounts Committee member) Deputy Carina Alves (Public Accounts Committee member) Deputy Rowland Huelin (Public Accounts Committee member) Tim Rogers (Public Accounts Committee member) Moz Scott (Public Accounts Committee member) Adrian Lane (Public Accounts Committee member)
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Deputy Suzie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources (Item 9 only)Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States (Items 8 and 9 only)Camilla Black, Strategic Finance Review Consultant (Items 8 and 9 only)Darra Singh, Engagement Partner, EY (Item 8 only)Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes (Item 9 only)Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny OfficerStephanie Addison, Assistant Scrutiny Officer (Items 1-8 only)Oliver Wilderspin, Project Trident Student

Action

It was noted that Chief Minister had written to States Members to inform them that the debate of the Common Strategic Policy (P.110/2018) had been moved from 20th	
November 2018 to 4th December 2018.	
Noting that a number of other items were likely to be scheduled for debate on 4th	
December, it was agreed that the Chairman would make contact with the Chairman of	
the Privileges and Procedures Committee to discuss the possibility of writing to the	
Chief Minister to express concern about moving the debate date of P.110/2018.	
4. Population and Migration	
It was noted that a seconing desumant and terms of reference for the Danal's review	
It was noted that a scoping document and terms of reference for the Panel's review	
had been drafted and would be circulated separately after the meeting.	
5. One Government	
The Panel received a letter from the Chief Minister dated 9th October 2018 responding	
to its request for information on the One Government programme.	
It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister to request further details in relation to a	
number of points made in the letter.	
6. Ministerial Decision process	
The Panel recalled that it had written to the Chief Executive of the States on 12th	
September about the Ministerial Decision process, and noted a response from the	
Chief Minister dated 9th October.	
It was agreed to refer the matter to the Privileges and Procedures Committee to	
consider.	
7. States Business	
The Panel noted items listed for debate at the States sitting on 23rd October.	
8. Finance Transformation Project	
······································	
The Panel met jointly with the Public Accounts Committee to receive a joint briefing on	
the Finance Transformation project.	
The briefing covered the following points:	
• The context of the project following the introduction of the role of Principle	
Accountable Officer	
The reason for change	
The work to be carried out	
 The integration with other change programmes across the States of Jersey 	
I he savings to be delivered by the project Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources	
5. Quarterly Fublic meaning with the minister for freasury and Resources	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, the Treasurer of the	
States and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and	
transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 30th October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Deputy Jess Perchard
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Records of Meetings	
The records of the meetings held on 2nd, 5th and 10th October 2018 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to request that the debate of the draft Damages Law be deferred until 15th January 2019 to allow it further time to complete its review.	
The Panel also agreed to schedule a short public hearing with the Chief Minister on the draft Law during the time already allocated for a quarterly public hearing on 5th November.	
3. Draft Budget 2019	
The Panel discussed its question plan for the public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources the following day.	
The Panel also discussed possible amendments to the draft Budget and agreed to discuss these further the following day.	
4. Revenue Administration Law	
It was noted that the Draft Revenue Administration Law had been lodged on 23rd October and it was agreed to request a briefing from Treasury officials on the draft Law.	SS
5. Common Strategic Policy	
Recalling that it had agreed to prepare an amendment to the Common Strategic Policy to add a 6th priority for the Council of Ministers entitled "nurturing a diverse community", the Panel noted that the amendment was being drafted and would need to be lodged by 20th November.	SS
6. Population and Migration	
The Panel noted and approved a scoping document and terms of reference in relation to its review. It was noted that a press release announcing the review would be prepared for the Chairman to review.	SS

7. Question Planning for Quarterly Hearing

The Panel discussed question areas for its quarterly public hearing with the Chief Minister on 5th November.

8. Transfers from the capital programme (R.132/2018)

The Panel recalled that it had previously identified concerns with transfers out of the States Capital Programme detailed in R.132/2018.

It was noted that following the Panel's last meeting, information had been requested from the relevant departments but was still outstanding. It was also noted that the Panel had written to the Minister for Treasury and Resources requesting the Minister not to proceed with the transfers while the Panel undertakes its investigations.

It was agreed to ask further questions of the Minister in the public hearing the following day.

Record of Meeting

Date: 31st October 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	
In attendance	Deputy Suzie Pinel, Minister for Treasury and Resources Deputy Lindsay Ash, Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes Alison Rogers, Director of Financial Planning and Performance Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Budget Review Hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources	
The Panel received the Minister for Treasury and Resources, the Treasurer of the States and officers for a public hearing in relation to the 2019 Budget. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
2. Draft Budget Statement 2019	
The Panel discussed possible amendments to the Budget and agreed to start scoping an amendment to reduce the number of stamp duty bands.	
The Panel also agreed to undertake further work to understand the position of stamp duty in relation to buy-to-let properties.	
3. Transfers from the capital programme (R.132/2018)	
It was noted that further information on the transfers from the capital programme in relation to Sandybrook Care Home and homes for children with autism had been received that day.	
In relation to Sandybrook, it was noted that £1.2m had been allocated in 2014 to upgrade and refurbish the care home. However, it was identified early on the project that the amount allocated was not sufficient and the project was put on hold. It was now proposed to return the funds to contingency, pending a review of the Island's Care Home requirements.	
It was agreed that the information provided was lacking in detail and it was further agreed to request more comprehensive briefing papers from the Department for Health and Community Services. It was agreed to ask specifically for an explanation of why more progress hadn't been made on the Sandybrook project over the previous 4 years, as well as the rationale for not prioritising some of the necessary work, such as the installation of fire equipment and hoists.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 5th November 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Senator John Le Fondré, Chief Minister Senator Tracy Vallois, Deputy Chief Minister (part of Item 1 only) Charlie Parker, Chief Executive and Head of the Public Service (Item 1 only) Jacquie McGeachie, Director, People Services (part of Item 1 only) Chris Stephenson, Director, HR Employment Relations and Organisational Development (part of Item 1 only) Paul Bradbury, Director of Corporate Policy (Item 1 only) Tom Walker, Director General, Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department (Item 2 only) Ruth Johnson, Director of Social Policy (Item 2 only) Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Minister	
The Panel received the Chief Minister, Deputy Chief Minister and officers for a quarterly public hearing. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
2. Damages Law Review Hearing	
The Panel then held a separate public hearing on the Draft Damages (Jersey) Law with the Chief Minister and officers from the Strategic Policy, Performance and Population Department. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 12th November 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Item 3 only: Nigel Minihane, Chairman, Primary Care Body Bertie Leigh, Consultant, Hempsons Solicitors Nadya Wolferstan, Partner, Hempsons Solicitors Elizabeth Thomas, Associate, Hempsons Solicitors

Agenda matter	
1. Draft Budget Statement 2019	
The Panel noted receipt of a briefing paper setting out options for its proposed amendment to stamp duty rates in the Budget. It was agreed to proceed with an amendment to simplify the number of stamp duty bands and reduce the stamp duty rate on properties between £600,000 and £1 million.	
The Panel discussed the key points to cover in its report and noted that a draft amendment and accompanying report would be prepared for its review.	SA
2. Common Strategic Policy	
The Panel reviewed a draft of its proposed amendment to the Common Strategic Policy in relation to "Nurturing a Diverse Community". Changes to the draft were discussed and it was noted that a revised draft would be circulated for consideration.	SS
3. Damages Law Review Hearing	
The Panel held a public hearing on the Draft Damages (Jersey) Law with the Chairman of the Primary Care Body and representatives of Hempsons Solicitors. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 13th November 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer
	Stephanie Addison, Assistant Scrutiny Officer
	Item 6 only:
	Nick Vaughan, Chief Economic Advisor
	Alison Rogers, Director of Financial Planning and Performance
	Greg Boyd, Senior Economist
	Item 7 only:
	Richard Summersgill, Comptroller of Taxes
	Paul Eastwood, Deputy Comptroller of Taxes
	Tom Queree, Legislation and Policy manager, Income Tax

Agenda Matter	Action
1. 2019 Meeting Dates	
The Panel reviewed and approved its schedule of meeting dates for 2019, subject to some minor adjustments.	SA
2. Draft Budget 2019	
It was noted that legislative drafting instructions had been issued in relation to the Panel's amendment to Stamp Duty rates in the Draft Budget 2019.	
It was noted that the draft Budget contained proposals intended to resolve concerns raised about the taxation of non-residents. It was further noted that the proposals took effect from the 2019 year of assessment. It was agreed to recommend in the Panel's report that the Minister should find a way to implement the proposals from the 2018 year of assessment.	SS
3. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel recalled its public hearing with Hempsons Solicitors and the Primary Care Body on 11th November. The Panel agreed that the evidence it received raised concerns about the draft Damages Law in a number of areas. These included the dual discount rate, the quantum of the discount rate, a lack of clarity around how Periodical payment Orders would be used and criticism of basing the draft law on the English model.	
It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister setting out the Panel's concerns and inviting the Chief Minister to meet with the Panel.	SS
The Panel discussed the question plan for its public hearing with the Trade Unions the following day.	

4. Common Strategic Policy	
The Panel noted that, following its previous meeting, a revised draft of its amendment to the Common Strategic Policy was being prepared for the Panel to consider.	
5. Law Society Disciplinary Panel	
The Panel reviewed and noted the recent Ministerial Decisions that fell within its remit. In particular, the Panel noted Ministerial Decision MD-C-2018-0170 regarding the appointment of members of the Law Society Disciplinary Panel and agreed to follow up on the parameters for the appointments contained in the decision.	SS
6. Briefing on Income Forecasts	
The Panel received a briefing from the States of Jersey Chief Economist and officers on the composition of the income forecasts set out in the Draft Budget Statement 2019.	
7. Briefing on Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel received a briefing from the Comptroller of Taxes and officers in relation to the draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 14th November 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Terry Renouf, President, Jersey Civil Service Association
	Mick Robbins, Vice-President, Jersey Civil Service Association
	Sam Cooper, Chairman, Jersey Head Teachers Association
	Marina Mauger, NASUWT The Teachers Union
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	
1. Budget Review Hearing with Trade Unions	
The Panel received representatives of Trade Unions for a public hearing in relation to the 2019 Budget. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 20th November 2018

Present	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert Deputy Jess Perchard
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	Senator Kristina Moore
In attendance	Robert MacRae QC, H.M. Attorney General
	Sylvia Roberts, Law Officers Department
	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Damages (Jersey) Law	
The Panel met with H.M. Attorney General (AG) in relation to the draft Damages (Jersey) Law.	
The record of the meeting was classified as exempt in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 31.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 23rd November 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman
	Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman
	Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard (by video conference)
	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
Apologies	
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Draft Budget Statement 2019	
The Panel reviewed the latest draft of its report on the Draft Budget Statement 2019. The draft report was approved for circulation to stakeholders, subject to certain changes being made. It was agreed that the final draft of the report would be provided to the Chairman for approval before being circulated to stakeholders.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 27th November 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Richard Vibert
	Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
It was noted that records of previous meetings had not been finalised in time to circulate to the Panel for review. It was agreed to defer approval of the records until a later date.	
2. Draft Budget 2019	
The Panel reviewed the final draft of its report on the draft Budget 2019 and noted the timeline for publication.	
It was agreed that the Chairman would provide a Chairman's foreword for inclusion in the report.	KM
3. Draft Damages Law	
The Panel agreed to arrange public hearings with BCR Law and the Institute and Faculty of Actuaries.	
Noting the challenging time line for reporting on the draft law and drafting any required amendments, the Panel agreed that it would be necessary to use its powers under Standing Orders to call-in the draft law for further scrutiny until 29th January 2019.	
It was noted that it would not be possible for the Panel to publish an interim report or comments paper prior to the principles of the draft law being debated on 4th December.	
4. Revenue Administration Law	
The Panel recalled that it had received a briefing on the draft Revenue Administration Law on 13th November. It was agreed to undertake a review of the draft law and to include in the scoping document, provision for two public hearings.	SS
5. Common Strategic Policy	
It was noted that the Panel's amendment to the Common Strategic Policy had been lodged on 20th November 2018, in advance of the debate of the policy on 4th December.	

6. Population and Migration	
The Panel agreed to issue a press release about its population and migration review in the week of 10th December.	SS
7. Transfers from the capital programme (R.132/2018)	
The Panel noted receipt of a briefing paper from the Health and Community Services Department in relation to the capital projects for children's homes and adult care homes.	
In consideration of both this report, and the information previously provided to the Panel in relation to Sandybrook Care Home, it was agreed to write to the Minister for Health and Social Services requesting his policy objectives in relation to both projects and asking for specific information about the scope of work required at Sandybrook.	SS
In light of the forthcoming debate of the 2019 capital programme as part of the budget, it was agreed to request a response prior to 4th December.	
8. Law Society Disciplinary Panel	
Recalling its previous discussions regarding R.143/2018 Law Society Disciplinary Panel: re-appointment of lay members, the Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to enquire about the possibility of amending the relevant legislation with regard to the ability of officers of the court to be members of the Law Society Disciplinary Panel.	SS

Record of Meeting

Date: 11th December 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
1. Records of Meetings	
The records of the meetings held on 12th, 16th, 30th and 31st October and 5th and 12th November 2018 were approved by the Panel.	
2. Common Strategic Policy	
It was noted that the Council of Ministers' Proposed Common Strategic Policy 2018-22 (P.110/2018), as amended, had been approved by the States Assembly the previous week.	
It was also noted that the Panel's proposed amendment to include "Nurturing a Diverse and Inclusive Society" within the Common Strategic Policy (CSP) had been subject to an amendment by the Council of Ministers to include this within the common themes of the CSP rather than as an additional strategic priority.	
Whilst noting that its amendment to the CSP, as amended by the Council of Ministers, had been approved by the States Assembly, the Panel agreed that it was disappointing that diversity and inclusion had not been accepted as a strategic priority for the Council of Ministers.	
It was agreed to continue promoting the importance of diversity. In the first instance, it was agreed to write to the Chair of the Jersey Appointments Commission to ask how diversity was considered within the Commission's guidelines and appointments which fell within its remit.	
3. Draft Budget 2019	
The Panel recalled that it had agreed to withdraw its amendment to the draft Budget 2019 in relation to Stamp Duty, due to unintended consequences which had been identified at a late stage. It was agreed to closely monitor the Minister for Treasury and Resources' response to the recommendations in the Panel's Budget Report on this matter and any subsequent follow up work.	
Noting the ongoing concerns around public sector pay and the narrow defeat of a proposition lodged by Deputy Geoff Southern on this matter, it was agreed to write to the Minister for Treasury and Resources to request an urgent response to the Panel's recommendation that the Minister bring an amendment to the Medium Term Financial Plan, to permit additional expenditure in 2019.	SS

4. Draft Damages Law

The Panel discussed possible areas of the draft Damages Law which might require amending, based on the evidence it had received. It was noted that any amendments would need to be agreed the following week, in order to allow sufficient time for legislative drafting.

It was noted that the Panel was due to hold a public hearing with BCR Law on Monday 17th December.

5. Revenue Administration Law

The Panel approved a scoping document and terms of reference for its review of the draft Revenue Administration (Jersey) Law, subject to minor amendments to the scoping document.

It was noted that a public hearing was due to be held on 20th December with the Minister for Treasury and Resources. The Panel discussed possible areas of questioning.

6. Work Programme

The Panel discussed its work programme for 2019 and agreed to undertake the following reviews:

- One Gov (commencing in February 2019)
- Population and Migration (commencing in March 2019)

It was noted that a scoping document and terms of reference would be prepared for the OneGov review.

It was agreed to write to the Chief Minister to advise of the Panel's intentions in relation **SS** to the review of Population and Migration.

It was also agreed to issue a press release in early 2019 to outline the Panel's priorities for 2019.

7. Transfers from the capital programme (R.132/2018)

The Panel recalled that it had written to the Minister for Health and Social Services on 28th November to request further information on the capital projects in relation to Sandybrook Care Home and homes for people with complex needs. Noting that a response was now a week overdue, it was agreed to raise the matter publicly, highlighting the lack of response.

8. States Business

The Panel reviewed forthcoming propositions to be debated which fell within its remit.

It was agreed to request further information about the Draft Public Employees (Pension Scheme) (Miscellaneous Amendments (Jersey) Regulations (P.141/2018) prior to the proposition being debated on 15th January 2019.

The Panel reviewed recent Ministerial Decisions which fell within its remit. It was agreed to request further information about recent appointments to the Jersey Teachers Superannuation Fund Board of Management and also with regard to recent decisions under the Control of Housing and Work (Jersey) Law.

The Panel discussed a recent decision to grant funding to Jersey College for Girls for an International Pilot Programme. It was agreed to refer the policy decision to support this programme to the Education and Home Affairs Panel to consider. It was also agreed to request further details of the approval process undertaken to approve the funding, including copies of any documentation considered by the Investment Appraisal Board.	SS
9. Future Meetings	
It was noted that the Panel's next scheduled meeting was on 8th January 2019 at 9.30am in the Blampied room.	

Record of Meeting

Date: 17th December 2018

Present	Senator Kristina Moore, Chairman Deputy Steve Ahier, Vice-Chairman Connétable Karen Shenton-Stone Deputy Jess Perchard
Apologies	Connétable Richard Vibert
In attendance	Simon Spottiswoode, Scrutiny Officer Item 1 only: Advocate David Benest, BCR Law Alexandra Baker, Solicitor, BCR Law

Agenda matter	Action
1. Damages Law Review Hearing	
The Panel held a public hearing on the Draft Damages (Jersey) Law with representatives from BCR Law. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.	
After the witnesses had withdrawn, the Panel agreed to write to the Chief Minister to outline some initial concerns with the draft Damages Law which had become clear from the evidence it had received.	SS
2. Transfers from the capital programme (R.132/2018)	
The Panel noted receipt of a response from the Health and Community Services Department to its letter to the Minister for Health and Social Services in relation to Sandybrook Care Home and homes for people with complex needs. It was agreed to publish the response and request further information in relation to some of the points raised.	SS